



<b>Provisional Mark</b>	<b>57%</b>
-------------------------	------------

## School of Social and Political Science – PG Feedback Form

<b>Course Instance</b>	<b>February 2014</b>
<b>Course Name</b>	<b>Involving Children and Young People in Research &amp; Consultation CPD</b>
<b>Component Name</b>	<b>Blog 1</b>

*Please note that both the comments and the grade remain provisional until ratified by the external Exam Board in May and will be subject to change, moderation and review by our external examiners. This includes whether or not any penalties imposed are upheld.*

<b>Exam number</b>	<b>Student C</b>
--------------------	------------------

**Overview**

<b>Marking criterion</b>	<b>Comment</b>	<b>Grade A-H (if appropriate)</b>
Critical/conceptual analysis	The focus on a method, rather than a resource, did then lead to analysis on certain elements (very relevant to the course) but not so much other particularities of the resource (e.g. ethical issues being considered?)  The blog benefits from considerations both for and against the use of this particular method, making very sound points.	B
Strength/cohesion of argument	The argument is fulsome and balanced, in considering pros and cons. At certain points the writing was somewhat contradictory, see below.	B
Use of sources/evidence	Bagnoli is made good use of, to move on the literature. More use of literature, based on sound argument/evidence, would have further strengthened the blog.	C
Structure & organisation	The blog is very easy to follow, with a clear description at the start.	A
Breadth and relevance of reading	See above.	C
Clarity of expression, presentation and referencing	The writing in itself was coherent and clear, except for some points being somewhat contradictory. Referencing was carefully provided.	B
Suggestions for future work	The use of a method, rather than a resource, made this harder to evaluate for the task set. It does seem that this exercise was productive for the writer, in thinking through this method.  For further work, the critical consideration of pros and cons would be worth continuing, as would the good structure particularly in introducing the reader to the topic. Ensuring all arguments are tightly made and additional reading would increase the quality of the analysis.	

*Susan Elsley and Kay Tisdall, as course convenors, maintain a file of anonymised assessments with feedbacks for further students to consult. If you would prefer to have your assignment not included within this file, please inform Kay Tisdall [k.tisdall@ed.ac.uk](mailto:k.tisdall@ed.ac.uk).*

Hello, I realise this is a method rather than a resource. However, it is still relevant to the courses aim of involving CYP in research and consultation.

## Resource evaluated – Collage

There are many resources which discuss the merits of using visual research methods to carry out research with children. Ruth Leitch (2008) covers a variety of visual methods in her book 'Doing visual research with children and young people'

One of the methods featured is Collage. This is a technique whereby different materials, objects and artefacts are pasted or fixed onto a surface in order to create an artistic composition based on a specific theme or subject (Leitch p44).

Compared to other visual methods, such as drawing, collage minimizes the need for artistic ability and has broader possibilities in terms of the age range of the children participating. Whereas drawing can be perceived as 'childish', especially by adolescents, the selecting of materials, images and phrases etc. in order to portray experiences, views and feelings is immediately more engaging and practical. Furthermore, basic collage materials such as paper, magazines, scissors and glue are generally accessible and the practice of cutting and sticking is something many children and young people are able to accomplish. However, Bagnoli (2009) notes that researchers need to be mindful of individual levels of artistic skills and confidence. Although the need for artistic ability is minimized through the use of collage, individuals may still feel inhibited and uneasy when asked to produce one. Moreover, the audience to which any creative projects are to be presented to and discussed with must be taken into account. Children and young people, especially adolescents, may be reluctant (un) consciously to reflect upon their individual feelings and views if they are seeking to earn the approval of their peers, which they often are. It is more likely that individuality may be sacrificed to fit in with group norms and values imagined to be shared with others.

In contrast, participants have more editorial control over their material as collages can be easily modified which allows the participant to feel more at ease with their own process of expression. Subsequently, this opens up opportunity for comment on individual experiences and perceptions. However, it should be noted that creative methods demand greater time and reflection on the part of the participant and the researcher. Analysis methods of visual studies tend to be written or oral. These methods often dismiss the real visual dimensions of the finished work and although the apparent visual message of a collage may appear to be self-evident, it is important that the researcher does not jump to conclusions or interpret the statements being made. A child-centred focus must remain during analysis if the symbolic content of the collage is to be interpreted and understood. Therefore it is important to be aware of alternative theories which will allow deeper understanding of the data being portrayed (Bagnoli 2010).

Overall, collage is a valuable method of allowing children and young people to communicate thoughts and feelings in a way that perhaps words cannot say.

Kay 3/7/14 18:47

**Comment [1]:** A clear description of the method.

Conventionally, you would write Leitch 2008 p.44

Kay 3/7/14 18:39

**Comment [2]:** Sound points

Kay 9/7/14 14:06

**Comment [3]:** All sound counter-points.  
Effective to use Bagnoli to move on argument.

Kay 9/7/14 14:06

**Comment [4]:** Is this sentence mixing arguments? You have written earlier in the sentence that the visual message can be dismissed.

## References:

Bagnoli, A. (2009) 'Beyond the Standard Interview: The Use of Graphic Elicitation and Arts-based Methods', *Qualitative Research, special issue*, 9(5), 547-570.

Bagnoli, A. (2010) *Using visual methods in research with young people* [online]. Available from <<http://www.ihs.manchester.ac.uk/ResearchNetworks/childhealth/workshops/AnnaBagnoli/presentation.pdf>> [accessed 10<sup>th</sup> March 2014]

Leitch, R. (2008) 'Creatively researching children's narratives through images and drawings' ed by Thomson, P. in *Doing visual research with children and young people*. Oxford:Routledge:44-49

TISDALL Kay 9/7/14 14:06

**Comment [5]:** Great, you have followed referencing conventions below.